DOI: 10.35464/1642-672X.PS.2020.1.14

PEDAGOGIKA SPOŁECZNA
Rok XIX 2020
Nr 1 (75)
Revisiting narrative structures
in the historiography of adult education

Barry J. Hake
independent researcher, Narbonne

'Organise, educate, agitate'. Pioneer women and organised adult learning, 1848–1919

ABSTRACT: Throughout the nineteenth century, nationalist movements in these countries engaged in wars of independence, national unification struggles, ideological work constructing national identities, together with cultural repertoires marking the social organisation the 'national enlightenment' of the people as 'citizens' of nation-states. These long-drawn-out ideological struggles – in France, Belgium, Denmark, Germany Hungary, Italy, and Poland – are examined here with specific reference to how women contributed to 'the making' of organised adult learning, and the development of a variety of cultural repertoires addressing different understandings of their 'citizenship' of the nation-state. The 'pioneering activities' of women from Central and Western Europe are examined here from a comparative historical perspective on 'organised adult learning' between 1849 and 1919. Within a cross-cultural framework, 'adult education' is conceptualised as the 'social organisation, by adults themselves or by others for adults, of deliberate, systematic, and sustained efforts to communicate and acquire knowledge, skills, and sensibilities'. focus on the critical analysis of the 'cultural repertoires' employed by these pioneers for the specific purpose of mobilising women's participation in 'socially organised adult learning.'

KEYWORDS: 'Organised adult learning' 'cultural repertoires' 'citizenship'.

The 'pioneering activities' of women from Central and Western Europe are examined here from a comparative historical perspective on 'organised adult learning' between 1849 and 1919. Within a cross-cultural framework, 'adult education' is conceptualised as the 'social organisation, by adults themselves or by others for adults, of deliberate, systematic, and sustained efforts to communicate and acquire knowledge, skills, and sensibilities'. Comparative reflections address the historical links between 'individual biographical trajectories in social space' of pioneer women, and their respective contributions

to the social organisation of the dissemination and acquisition of knowledge, skills, and sensibilities. These reflections focus on the critical analysis of the 'cultural repertoires' employed by these pioneers for the specific purpose of mobilising women's participation in 'socially organised adult learning.' Cultural repertoires are defined here as the articulation by actors of structured ideological positions addressing discrete strategies, measures, and instruments for the social organisation of learning as individual and collective cultural resources (Tarrow, 1994; Tilly, 2006). These cultural repertoires constituted significant 'cultural scripts' during the 'long nineteenth century' from 1789 to 1919, which framed individual and collective responses to the ongoing formation of European nation-states with borders subjected to frequent (re-)negotiation.

Post-1789, the case-studies refer respectively to the tripartite partition of the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth from 1795 to 1918; instability of imperial, monarchical, and republican regimes in France throughout the nineteenth century; recognition of Belgium in 1830 as a nation-state constituted by Francophone and Flemish linguistic communities; unification of the Italy states from 1861 onwards; Denmark's final transition from colonial power to nation-state in 1864; establishment of the unified German empire in 1871; and the shifting fortunes of Hungarian nationalist aspirations within the Austro-Hungarian empire after 1867. Throughout the nineteenth century, nationalist movements in these countries engaged in wars of independence, national unification struggles, ideological work constructing national identities, together with cultural repertoires marking the social organisation the 'national enlightenment' of the people as 'citizens' of nation-states. These long-drawn-out ideological struggles – in France, Belgium, Denmark, Germany Hungary, Italy, and Poland – are examined here with specific reference to how women contributed to 'the making' of organised adult learning, and the development of a variety of cultural repertoires addressing different understandings of their 'citizenship' of the nation-state.

The social organisation of adult learning post-1789 is examined in terms of the changing delineations of 'residual', 'statist', 'alternative', and 'oppositional' cultural repertoires in different European nation-state (Johnson, 1979). This was marked by historical decline of residual forms of organised learning based 'private' cultural resources, such as private philanthropy, institutionalised charity, selective patronage, voluntary organisations, collective self-help, and the marketplace for instructive 'reading matter'. During the nineteenth century, innovative forms of mutually organised adult learning often manifested 'alternative' repertoires, such as utopian socialism and workers' co-operatives (Laot, 2018). 'Independent working-class' repertoires organised workers' read-

ing rooms and libraries, while a range of 'alternative' cultural repertoires involved critics of 'industrial society'. Independent of the nation-state, institutionalised charity, and employers, these repertoires sought to promote social reform, albeit within the established social order of emerging nation-states (Hake & Laot, 2009). Nevertheless, these critical cultural movements increasingly made way for political agitation articulating 'statist' repertoires, which focused on mobilising collective resources to establish 'public provision', recognised by, and, preferably, funded by nation-states. Primarily addressing elementary instruction, working conditions, housing, and social hygiene, these 'statist' repertoires enjoyed support from bourgeois liberals, radicals, freemasons, and free-thinkers, but also found a growing constituency among reform-minded working-class political parties and trade unions. Furthermore, the later nineteenth century witnessed emergent 'oppositional' cultural repertoires of collective forms of 'underground' adult learning organised by radical 'nationalist', 'anarchist', 'syndicalist', 'socialist', and 'communist' movements. 'Underground' repertoires sought to counter the hegemony of repressive economic, political, and social orders through their 'revolutionary' cultural action.

Learning in the shadows of 'statist' repertoires

Despite 1789's promise of 'public space' for French women, conservative reaction from 1795 onwards entrapped them in privatised domestication, opposed only by utopian socialist practices, and unsuccessful revolutionary politics in 1848 (Melzer & Rabine, 1992). From 1860 onwards, however French discourses on the 'woman question' increasingly addressed bourgeois women's access to education and 'charitable work' to expand their 'public' sphere of activity with growing recognition of employment for middle-class young women in applied arts, plus traditional trades dress-making, embroidery, and millinery for *petit-bourgeois* and artisan young women, but also expanding to commercial skills, such as bookkeeping, required by France's urban economy. Initiatives by French women activists, some with Saint-Simonian connections, played significant roles in organising vocational training for these women, thus enabling them to earn independent incomes. Some innovative forms of provision acquired 'statist' characteristics with 'public' funding from city councils and Chambers of Commerce, recognition by the Ministry of Commerce, and, in the Third Republic, the Ministry of Public Instruction. Statist repertoires addressing women's vocational instruction were enhanced by public inquiries, establishment of systems of inspection, and legislation on vocational training schools in the 1880s. Luquin's advocacy of women's employment op-

portunities involved the significant transnational role of international exhibitions within statist repertoires to promote 'national' economic interests (Rogers & Boussahba-Bravard, 2018). In the 1870s, following defeat by Prussia in 1871, French concerns with national reputation were heightened by the need to train the workforce, including working women. Furthermore, after decades of confessional and conservative resistance to public instruction for women, many French women activists associated with the Radical Party, and other supporters of vocational training for women, turned a blind eye to the conservative reticence of Republican politicians concerning the question of women's suffrage. The growth of socialist parties in France introduced little change; French women had to tolerate this 'institutionalised reticence' regarding women's 'political citizenship' until 1944.

Following Denmark's military defeat by Prussia in 1864, the folk high schools – residential courses lasting winter five months, originally for young men – expressed the national-conservative movement's aspiration to regenerate Danish national identity among rural farming and small-holding communities. During the late nineteenth century, however, modernisation undermined the traditional rural family economy with male-dominated labour-intensive cooperatives replacing women's farm-based dairying responsibilities, while their traditional housework tasks of spinning, weaving, baking were eroded by urban manufactured goods, and domestic servants became less available in rural areas. While these shifting gender divisions led rural middle-class women to seek new ways of investing in themselves, they also increasingly became the targets of government interventions to strengthen married women's economic status by introducing organised adult learning enabling them to qualify women to responsibly perform their caring responsibilities. For this purpose, Magdalene Lauridsen, a teacher of weaving, launched courses in home economics for young women in 1895, arguing that women's training in domestic matters should be based on the same scientific grounds as men's training in agriculture, indeed recognition of 'housework' as an occupation demanding training and qualifications. Regarding 'the woman question', Lauridsen explicitly distanced herself from middle-class urban women's concerns. Her activities focused exclusively on folk high school courses for rural women supported financially by the Danish state. Her approach was informed by a grant-aided study tour to England in 1899 to investigate rural 'extension teaching', and, with support from farmers' organisations, she started itinerant evening-classes for women in 1902, which were taken over by the Federation of Danish Housewives. Appropriating the system of state grants, established in 1874 for men's folk high schools, this resulted in a system of state-subsidised teacher-

training in home economics served by a network of itinerant teachers of adult women and advisors for local women's organisations; the Association of Danish Home Economics Teachers was formed in 1906. Legislation in 1914 enabled municipalities to fund adult education classes in home economics. As with the folk high schools, public grants became the dominant source of income for home economics instruction for women. This was a crucial factor in the growing influence of central and, increasingly, municipal governments in constructing the statist repertoire of organised adult learning in Denmark from the 1870s until the First World War.

If statist repertoires in France and Denmark addressed the differing urban and rural conditions of economic modernisation and gendered employment opportunities available to women, emergent statist repertoires in imperial Germany understood 'the woman question' in terms of employment opportunities for so-called 'surplus' of unmarried women (Dollard, 2009). Like other Jewish middle-class women, Josephine Levy-Rathenau, born into a well-to-do Berlin family, shared Jewish women's tripartite motivation as Germans, Jews, and women to promote women's common interests. From 1894, she played a leading role in the moderate bourgeois Federation of German Women's Associations (FGWA) – including women leaders of 'social-welfare work' professions, including 'popular education' – the 'modernist' Berlin Women's Club in 1900, the Jewish Women's League in 1904, and the National Women's Services (NWS) during World War One. A suffragist, feminist, and social activist, she was an advocate of social justice involving women's right to work, equal conditions of employment, women's arbitration, rights to vocational training, and career guidance. To help women become more independent and find employment, Levy-Rathenau established an Information Centre for Women's Jobs in 1902, the first independent women's vocational guidance service in Germany, and she organised the Association for Women's Vocational Training for Trades and Industry, from 1909 until 1921, to improve training opportunities, particularly apprenticeships for young women as opposed to traditional domestic or factory work (Frevert, 1986).

The First World War, 1914–1918, radically transformed pre-war understandings of 'the woman question', with Jewish women contributing significantly to the NWS wartime focus on German women as 'patriotic maternal citizens' through their common participation in the war effort (Steer, 2015). Levy-Rathenau, and Alice Salomon, for example, supervised women volunteers, including work with prisoners-of-war, on the Western and Eastern military fronts. This NWS 'nationalist home-guard' mobilised female volunteers for 'war-work' in factories and farms, organised food distribution and rationing,

and itinerant cooking courses by volunteers. This 'patriotic' repertoire of women's organisations collapsed post-1918, when the nationalist-inspired FGWA rejected the Treaty of Versailles and the League of Nations as anti-German. Jewish women's organisations, however, refocused their activities on the German Jewish community's needs, while also contributing significantly to the repertoire of reconciliation through their work for international co-operation. The FGWA war contributed significantly, however, to professionalisation, indeed state-initiated bureaucratisation, of social-welfare work, thus laying the foundations for the post-war Weimar Republic's 'corporative statist' repertoire combining adult education and social work serving the 'nation-building' needs of the German nation-state. As a suffragist, Levy-Rathenau welcomed the 1919 Weimar constitution granting women civic and political equality, and she was active in the moderate left-liberal German Democratic Party – the party favoured by German Jews between 1918 and 1930 – until her premature death in 1921.

Underground learning: Polish 'patriotic' repertoires and the 'nationalist' turn

From 1772 until 1918, partitioning of the Commonwealth lands of Poland and Lithuania by the Russian and Austro-Hungarian empires, and the Kingdom of Prussia – 67% of Polish territory was Russian, 22% Austrian, and 11% German – laid the foundations for socially organised adult learning in response to political, economic, social, and cultural transformations, and shifting understandings of 'the woman' question in relation to agrarian and industrial society. Against the background of failed patriotic uprisings in 1795, 1830, and 1848, the post-1864 gradualist conservative liberal agenda, in the form of 'Warsaw Positivism' as a programme of social reform, rejected armed insurrection in favour of limited political autonomy, economic modernisation, and a 'constructive patriotic repertoire' of self-organised social-cultural activities to maintain Polish values (Blejwas, 1984). From the mid-1870s, however, with institutional instruction under foreign control and Polish banned as a language for instruction, it became necessary to counter systematic Russification and Germanisation policies through the radical organisation of 'underground adult instruction' focused on 'patriotic' self-formation and mutual learning. With Russian repressing all vernacular instruction, while Prussia banned grass-root organisations, such as the Society for Popular Education (Towarzystwo Oświaty Ludowej) in 1872 and the Society for Reading Rooms (Towarzystwo Czytelni Ludowych) in 1880, the Austro-Hungarian dual monar-

chy in Galicia adopted more tolerant multicultural policies towards Polish after 1867. This encouraged mutual adult learning and self-help activities in local communities and the universities of Cracow and Lvov contributing to Polish intellectual life. During the 1880s, women increasingly demonstrated their 'patriotic duty' to instruct themselves and their families by organising mutual underground learning, while the Women's Circle for Popular Education (Kobiece Koło Oświaty Ludowej), created in 1888, organised popular instruction among local peasant communities. Furthermore, from the early 1880s, young women participated in the so-called 'flying university' which offered a structured teaching programme, illegally in Polish, to university-aged students. Organised since 1886 by the social activist Jadwiga Szczawińska-Dawidowa, this clandestine organisation provided a course of 10 hours per week lasting 6 years to students unable to finance their studies abroad. With young women comprising 70% of students, predominantly from the impoverished gentry and professional intelligentsia milieus, many of whom lived economically precarious lives seeking paid employment, this underground organisation was known as the 'petticoat' university. Despite splintering in 1894 following Szczawińska-Dawidowa's imprisonment, between 1883 and 1905 about three thousand women received diplomas.

Many of this underground organisation's students subsequently made significant contributions to a broadly-based 'patriotic repertoire' of clandestine associations offering support for a diverse popular range of popular instruction, mutual learning, self-teaching, reading rooms, libraries, journals, and newspapers in the vernacular. Russian and German partition authorities applied severe measures against these women, suspecting them, correctly, as 'patriotic' activists for the preservation of Polish culture. Constantly facing arrest, bans, imprisonment, exile and even execution, women activists, including Szczawińska-Dawidowa, Moszczeńska, Radlińska, Sempołowska, but also Jadwiga Dziubińska, together with thousands of volunteer patriots, both women and men, organised a wide range of underground illegal adult learning activities that addressed equality of women, emancipation of peasants, and, increasingly, industrial workers, assimilation of Jews, and campaigned to reduce rampant adult illiteracy. Involved in the Women's Circle for Popular Education in Galicia, Helena Radlińska produced popular book collections promoting knowledge of Polish history and culture for a popular audience, including *Who Was Mickiewicz?* popularising Poland's romantic bard, after whom the Adam Mickiewicz People's University (Uniwersytet Ludowy im. A. Mickiewicza) in Cracow was named in 1897. Before returning to Warsaw, Sempołowska, also a Circle member, conducted courses for teachers from rural areas in order

to disseminate democratic and patriotic values and deepen peasants' bonds with Polish culture. When living in the Prussian partition, Moszczeńska, was involved, for the Association of Women of the Crown and Lithuania (Koło Kobiet Korony i Litwy), in the particularly dangerous underground activities of the 'book carriers' who smuggled illegal literature, clandestine books, political pamphlets, scientific publications, popular literature, and newspapers across borders.

Liberal hopes of social harmony and patriotic unity were increasingly disrupted during the late 1880s by growing social tensions and divisions resulting from rapid industrialisation and urbanisation in the Russian and German partitions, with the Austrian partition remaining largely agricultural. In the *fin de siècle* Polish lands, the key issues addressed by organisers of this repertoire of underground learning increasingly focused on the 'woman question' in illegal study-circles, the 'social question' concerning peasants and workers, the 'Polish question' of national identity, and, increasingly, the 'Jewish question' (Blobaum, 2002). This marked the transformation of the reformist 'patriotic' repertoire with the emergence of mass political parties and 'oppositional' political movements propagating the conflicting vocabularies of 'nationalism' voiced by socialists – with nationalists rather than internationalists gaining the upper hand – agrarian populists, and the right-wing National Democrats (Narodowa Demokracja – ND), the latter articulating a traditional patriarchal position. With political tensions and strikes in the German partition, revolution in 1905 erupted throughout the Russian partition with militant women participating in demonstrations, strikes, and armed insurrection organised by the Polish Socialist Party (Polska Parta Socjalistyczna – PPS) demanding improved living conditions, political rights, and Polish autonomy. With the October Manifesto, urban agitators with political affiliations began to play an active role in rural areas in community action, political propaganda work, and widespread agitation among peasants carried out by with peasants in the rural areas by National Democrats, Polish Peasant Union (Polski Związek Ludowy – PZL), and the PPS. During the revolutionary events of 1905–1907, the University for All (Uniwersytet dla Wszystkich) and Association of Polish Culture (Towarzystwo Kultury Polskiej) organisations were especially active and conducted openly organised learning activities, as was the Association of Mutual Aid Societies (Związek Towarzystw Samopomocy Społecznej). Demonstrating their patriotic engagement as teachers, organisers, scholars, journalists, and social activists, Sempołowska and Radlińska were engaged in political and humanitarian action, including legal assistance, for the Association for Relief of Political Prisoners (Towarzystwo Pomocy Więźniom Politycznym), with PPS

support; both were exiled, Sempołowska to Galicia, Radlińska with exiled husband to Western Siberia (Kenney, 2012). Pressured by revolutionary sentiment and domestic unrest 1905–1907, restrictions on the Polish public sphere were substantially relaxed to the benefit of political, social, and cultural life. Having formed a common patriotic front with men during strikes and manifestations, women were the major beneficiaries of these events. Polish became the language of instruction, while scores of cultural, educational, scientific, economic, co-operative, professional and other associations were recognised, while social activists and scholars associated with the underground flying university secured approval for the Society for Educational Courses (Towarzystwo Kursów Naukowych) in 1906. Further concessions by Russian authorities facilitated Dziubińska's expanding activities with peasants' schools supported by the Polish Peasant Union (PZL), allied with PPS, while Radlińska, having returned to Cracow was involved in workers' educational associations associated with Piłsudski's PPS.

If the 1905–1907 revolution manifested the emergence of political modernity in the Polish lands with mass parties of socialists and national democrats, the post-revolutionary period was dominated by bloody suppression, withdrawal of many concessions granted to Poles by the Russian authorities, and social disintegration. This was sectarian struggles over elections to the Russian State Duma, and increasingly exclusive understandings of 'the Jewish question', political anti-Semitism, and escalating anti-Semitic propaganda in the Polish public sphere. From 1910 onwards, with even luminaries of liberal positivism were questioning Jewish economic expansion in the Polish lands. Erstwhile anti-clerical free thinkers and suffragists like the publicist Izabella Moszczeńska – translator of Ellen Key in 1907 – brought 'the Jewish question' to the attention of educated Polish opinion (Weeks, 1995). She expressed the 'progressive anti-Semitic' opinion in *Kurier Poranny* (Morning Courrier), that Jews were hampering modernisation of Polish society, and that towns and cities must be 'Polonised' (Krzywiec, 2009: 160). Inspired by the right-wing National Democrats and the anti-semitic press, and some socialist organisations, a boycott, not entirely successful, of Jewish shops, doctors, lawyers, singers, performers, writers and artists took place from November 1912 until the outbreak of World War I. When the partition empires became enemies in World War I, Moszczeńska, an outspoken 'national feminist', was instrumental in organising the Women's War Emergency League as an umbrella women's organisation. It supported Polish military forces during the military conflicts, civil war, economic disruption, and social chaos, while women's informal learning networks supported para-military units in the struggle for independence

and freedom (Stelmaszuk, 1994, p. 225). Moszczeńska viewed the full suffrage granted to women by the independent Polish nation-state in 1918, as the just reward for their unflinching 'patriotism.'

Alternative cultural, social democratic, and internationalist repertoires

Throughout the 19th-century, utopian socialism constituted a significant cross-cultural undercurrent informing alternative repertoires for radical social reform. Isabelle Laure Gatti de Gamond's parents, financially ruined following failure of a Fourier-inspired utopian community in the mid-1840s, returned to Brussels (Gubin, Piette & Jacques, 1997). Following her mother's early death in 1854, Isabelle, aged 15, became governess for Polish nobles. Returning to Brussels in 1861, she attended public lectures, intended for men, in physics and chemistry, encountered the sociability of bourgeois salons, and published the journal *Women's Education*. With Catholic education increasingly criticised by Belgian secularists, Gatti de Gamond was active in cultural organisations involving radical liberals, freemasons and freethinkers, and successfully lobbied the municipal council to support a secular secondary school for girls. Opened in 1864, eighteen schools elsewhere in Belgium opened within ten years. With Brussels a stronghold of liberalism and anti-clerical radicalism, the League of Education, established in 1864 by her friend Charles Buls, promoted secular schools, but also organised lectures, reading rooms, and libraries (de Spiegeleer, 2019). With radical liberals and republicans from other countries, meetings of the International Social Science Association were a platform for Gatti de Gamond's ideas, for example, that, mothers of girls in her own schools should attend their daughters' lessons for their own development (de Spiegeleer, 2019). This was a forum also frequented by Jean Macé, an erstwhile Fourierist known to Gamond's parents and acquainted with Jeanne Deroin, who, as an anti-clerical republican and freemason established the French League of Education in 1866 (Van Praet & Verbruggen, 2015).

In 1891, Gatti de Gamond's proposal for a pre-university course for women to improve access to higher education was supported by Buls, now mayor of Brussels, liberals and socialists. Moreover, following her criticism of the 1889 law on women's working hours, her socialist sympathies became more explicit. In 1893, she supported the Belgian Workers' Party proposal to establish university extension lectures, and she supported lectures by Elisée Reclus, exiled French veteran of the 1871 Paris Commune and anarchist socialist (Steele, 1997). She was increasingly associated with Marie Bonnevial

– also an exiled French veteran of 1871 – who attended the opening in 1895 of the People's House in Brussels, established by the Belgian Workers' Party, and both were involved in internationalist socialist advocacy addressing women's working conditions (Laqua, 2015). Gatti de Gamond expressed increasingly pacifist and internationalist views in local women socialists' propaganda clubs, her own journal *Cahiers féministes*, and the socialist newspaper *Le Peuple*. Following retirement in 1899, her socialist involvement and support for state interventions increased radically. She participated in the first conference of socialist women in 1899, was member of the organising committee for the Congress of Women Workers in 1900, secretary of the National Federation of Women Socialists in 1901, and, in 1902, was appointed member of the General Council of the Belgian Workers' Party. However, when the party decided in 1902, for electoral reasons, to not actively advocate women's suffrage, Gatti de Gamond conformed. She became a Freemason in Paris in 1903. Belgian women were granted the right to vote in 1948.

Anna Fraentzel, born to a bourgeois Berlin family in 1878, trained as a nurse in Hamburg, married Angelo Celli, an Italian malaria specialist, and moved to Rome in 1899 joining Celli's anti-malarial work. Shocked by rampant illiteracy in the Agro Romana region, Anna embraced his conviction that literacy was the best preventive strategy. As a member of the Rome branch of the National Women's Union – inspired by bourgeois philanthropic 'practical feminism' addressing women's working conditions and education – she organised, in 1904, together with the activist feminist Sibilla Aleramo, rudimentary literacy courses as a secular Sunday school (Snowden, 2003). Despite a boycott by Catholic landowners, further courses took place in 1905–1906. In 1907, having successfully solicited funds from left-leaning friends, she recruited voluntary teachers in Roman schools, and mobilised support of leading Roman intellectuals including the writers Giovanni Cena, Sibilla Aleramo was his partner, artists Duilio Cambellotti and Giacomo Balla, and Alessandro Marcucci, pedagogue and civil servant. Anna was elected president of the Committee of the Peasant School, with Marcucci organising the schools. Despite successive financial crises, more schools were opened. In 1911, the literacy work of Fraentzel and Cena was presented during the International Exhibition of Fine Art celebrating the 50th anniversary of the unified Italian nation-state, with Anna and Cena were awarded gold medals, Marcucci the silver. Paintings by Balla of peasants cultivating fields and an exhibition of implements and utensils constituted a 'vernacular alternative culture', that paid homage to continuity in traditional craft-based Italian rural life, which was threatened by poverty, urbanisation, and mass emigration. The first brick-built school was opened in the same year; a symbol of positive modernisation.

Inspired by different ideological understandings of the 'social question', they contributed diverse social-cultural activities to challenge structural exclusion of the illiterate, impoverished, and exploited peasants in the Agro Romana, described by Cena as 'voluntary patrols in the battle against illiteracy' (Wallace, 2006, p. 72), and as 'the Garibaldini of literacy' by Marcucci. As humanitarians, Fraentzel and Celli, a Republican deputy, focused on social hygiene, Cena, editor of the influential intellectual review *Nuovo Antologia*, and Aleramo, writing about the 'woman question' since 1897, were social humanitarians, while Cambellotti, Balla, and Marcucci, were freemasons animated by humanitarian socialist political ideals. Critical of the social and cultural establishment, this circle of social reformers manifested an 'alternative cultural repertoire' of political action, social reform, and artistic activities that contrasted starkly with Italian identity based on classical forms. They also represented significant 'internationalist' influences in Italian social and cultural life. Cena, Cambellotti and Balli were adherents of the social, political and aesthetic ideas of the social reformers Morris, Ruskin, and Tolstoy on making art accessible to all, knew the arts and crafts and art nouveau movements well, while also Marcucci had profound knowledge of the modernist architecture epitomised by public buildings, such as People's Palace in London and People's House in Brussels with their decided spatial contributions to 'public pedagogy'. Cena's circle revered Leo Tolstoy, whose *What is Art?* published in 1897 and in Italian in 1900, served them as a socio-political agenda for their consciousness-raising work. In the absence of meaningful intervention by public agencies, these initiatives constituted the nucleus of 'alternative' secular welfare-educational institutions in rural southern Italy, while they sought to raise the civic conscience of the post-unification bourgeoisie who were predominantly concerned with the industrial working-class challenge in the north. Confronted with the formation of *Italy's* first *nationalist* political movement, the Italian Nationalist Association founded in *1910,* Cena's circle, in keeping with their social-humanist and pacifist tendencies, opposed, with little effect, Italy's declaration of war in 1914 and argued for absolute neutrality. Italian women acquired full suffrage in 1945. The activities of the peasant schools ceased in 1978.

Although the Austrian empire repressed Kossuth's national independence movement in 1848–1849, partial Hungarian autonomy in 1867 led to late nineteenth-century economic development which was characterised by growth of independent working-class organisations, agrarian socialism among peasants, women's movements, and progressive free-thinking urban intellectuals. In response, government cultural policies promoted Magyar-inspired cultural associations, nationalist-inspired university extension classes, and Catholic peasant

Sunday schools. Urban women's class-based organisations propagated different understandings of the 'woman question'. From 1896, secular liberal feminists of the National Association of Female Clerical Workers, establised by Vilma Glücklich, teacher and first female university graduate in 1898, and Rózsa Bédy Schwimmer, a book-keeper, promoted vocational education and training for commercial middle-class women. From 1904, the Feminist Alliance also voiced the gradualist arguement for suffrage; both organisations had predominantly middle-class Jewish membership. Working-class women's interests, including agrarian socialists, were propagated by the Hungarian Women Workers Association, also established in 1904, and affiliated with social democratic national and international organisations, including the Second International. As Jewish bourgeois feminist activists, Schwimmer and Glücklich prioritised educational opportunities, working conditions, and suffrage, but rejected an alliance with the social democrats' campaign favouring universal suffrage, seeking, mistakingly, support from the liberal élite.

These Jewish liberal feminist reformers constituted the pre-war forum for pacifists and peace activists, who opposed Austro-Hungary's participation in World War One and were active in the international women's peace movement (Szapor, 2018). Combining teaching with unground opposition to war, Glücklich was a co-founder, in 1915, with pacifist social reformers Jane Addams and Aletta Jacobs of the International Committee of Women for Permanent Peace, renamed 1919 as the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF). Involved in International Woman Suffrage Alliance lectures and feminist journalism in London in 1914, Schwimmer was unable to return to Hungary, spending the war undertaking international peace propaganda work (Rupp, 1997). In the independent nation-state of post-war Hungary, both women were involved in national politics during the ill-fated Károlyi government 1918–1919, but both were banned during the short-lived Hungarian Soviet Republic in 1919. In 1920, Schwimmer fled to Vienna, and to the USA in 1921, where she died in1948, a supporter of a world federal government, but a stateless person. Dismissed from teaching by the counter-revolutionary Horty regime in 1921, Glücklich became Secretary, in 1922, of the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, in Geneva, focusing on training teachers in methods of international education, until her death in 1926. Post-war stability implemented by the nationalist Horty regime brought repression of organised adult learning associated with worker's internationalism and feminist activism, which were replaced by deeply nationalist ideologies and anti-semitic policies (Steele, 2007, p. 256). Following the 1920 Treaty of Trianon, women's access to higher education survived restrictions proposed

in 1921, but access for Jews to higher education, both men and women, was decimated to accommodate ethnic Hungarian male refugees from the now independent nation-states of Croatia, Czeckia, Roumania, and Slovakia.

Historiography of organised adult learning: the long arm of nationalism

The historiography of organised adult learning in Europe, 1848–1919, was marked significantly by the shifting shadows of geo-political realignments of national borders. The case-studies serve to remind us that women were significant historical actors involved in the social and cultural practices recognised as organised adult learning. During the 19th century, these practices increasingly became targets for social reformers and radical social movements, reactionary interventions by fading empires, increasingly confident governments of newly independent nation-states, and predatory advances of the educational marketplace. They also remind us that the history of organised learning involved women in border-crossings, sometimes voluntarily as 'internationalists', sometimes as the result of changing national borders, but also as the result of occupation by a foreign power, political banishment, or self-chosen exile. This serves to redirect our attention to the history of organised adult learning as recovering the cartography of unmapped and often forgotten border-crossings. Furthermore, the historiography of women's agency as both individual and collective actors has also been distorted by histories of socially organised adult learning that have been appropriated in order to actively construct 'national tradition', indeed 'national identity', and have served the 'nationalist' purpose of articulating the 'singularity' of 'national culture' compared to 'elsewhere'. More pertinently, this has shaped what is selectively remembered, and, what is systematically erased from 'national histories' of organised adult learning. This is reflected in contemporary tendencies towards establishing 'national identity' as 'difference', the reassertion of national traditions, and the current retreat to biographies as a manifestation of 'local' self-assertion. It is all too possible for this to ignore the dangerous waters of parochialism, and, indeed, the narcissism that is all too characteristic of 'populist' movements.

The cases also remind us that this was a period marked by the growing professionalisation of those cultural repertoires increasingly recognised as those forms of 'social work' and 'adult education' recognised and funded by nation-states. This has tended, however, to reinforce tendencies to distort historical understanding of the gendered development of these professions, while

the organisation of research into 'adult education' practices has increasingly excluded the 'helping' professions, and, above all, all that is 'vocational' in relation to the labour market. As the case-studies demonstrate, these historical shifts have been closely related to problems of defining the legitimate objects of scientific research regarding such diverse social and cultural practices. This calls for greater awareness of the dangers of professional deformation associated with a-historical, let alone unscientific, questions as to whether pioneering women in the nineteenth century were engaged in 'social work' or 'adult education'. From a cross-cultural perspective 'adult education' can refer to very different social and cultural phenomena in different places, and this raises questions of definition, and where to locate the boundaries of 'adult education'. In a trivial sense, 'adult education' is often recognised as referring to those institutions who regard themselves as delivering 'education to adults', in other words the 'institutionalist' fallacy. As the case studies make all too clear, the historiography of socially organised adult learning must necessarily include learning embedded in utopian communities, learning organised by avant-garde cultural movements, underground learning organised by 'patriots' and 'nationalists' in occupied territories, and collective learning organised by revolutionary political movements. The 'history of adult education' captured by these case studies of women pioneers serves to recover the social sites of adults involvement in organised learning efforts to change the world by learning to think, and act, in often unconventional, and, sometimes, cosmopolitan ways.

Finally, the case studies make clear the historical research is also needed that offers a critique of cross-cultural misunderstandings. Thomas Carlyle, for instance, was widely admired by female social reformers throughout Europe, who regarded him as a critic of unbridled industrialisation, and as a male champion of social reform alongside Arnold Toynbee, John Ruskin, William Morris, and Leo Tolstoy (Cockram, 2007). In 1894, Morris, founder of the Socialist League, delivered the oration at the funeral of Jeanne Deroin, born in Paris in 1804 (Kunka, 2016). This suggests the serious need to refocus the historiography of organised adult learning during the long 19th century on more historically informed cross-cultural understandings of the political economy of socially organised learning that deepen our knowledge of border crossings.

Bibliography

Blejwas, S.A. (1984). *Realism in Polish politics: Warsaw Positivism and national survival in nineteenth century Poland*, New Haven: Yale UP.

Blobaum, R.E. (2002). 'The "Woman Question" in Russian Poland, 1900–1914, *Journal of Social History*, 35, 4, 799–824.

Cockram, G. (2007). *Ruskin and Social Reform: Ethics and Economics in the Victorian Age*, London: Tauris Academic Studies.

Dollard, C.L. (2009). *The Surplus Woman: Unmarried in Imperial Germany, 1871–1918*, New York: Berghahn Books.

Frevert, U. (1986). *Frauen-Geschichte: Zwischen bürgerlicher Verbesserung und neuer Weiblichkeit*, Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp.

Gubin, E., Valérie Piette & Catherine Jacques (1997). 'Les féminismes belges et français de 1830 à 1914 : Une approche comparée, *Le mouvement social,* 178, 36–68.

Gröning, K. (2010). *Entwicklungslinien pädagogischer Beratungsarbeit: Anfänge, Konflikte, Diskurse*, Wiesbaden: Springer-Verlag.

Hake, B.J, & Laot, F.F.(eds.) (2009). *The Social Question and Adult Education: European Perspectives in the 19th and 20th Centuries/La question sociale et l'éducation des adultes: Perspectives européennes, XIXe – XXe siècles*, Frankfurt/Main: Peter Lang.

Johnson, R. (1979) '"Really useful knowledge": radical education and working-class culture, 1790–1848'. In. John Clarke, Chas Critcher & Richard Johnson (eds) *Working-class Culture: Studies in history and theory*, London: Hutchison.

Kenney, P. (2012), '"I felt a kind of pleasure in seeing them treat us brutally."' The Emergence of the Political Prisoner, 1865–1910, *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 54 (4), 863–889.

Krzywiec, G. (2009), 'The Polish intelligentsia in the face of the "Jewish question" (1905–1914)', *Acta Poloniae Historica*, 100, 29–165.

Kunka, F. (2016). 'The French Teacher at Kelmscott House: Cécile Desroches, Jeanne Deroin and the Utopian Socialist Connection', *The Journal of William Morris Studies*, XXII, 1, 1–17.

Laot, F.F.(2018). 'Jeanne Deroin et l'éducation mutuelle des femmes et des prolétaires'. In. Laot, F.F & Solar, C. (eds). *Pionnières de l'éducation des adultes, perspectives internationales*, Paris: L'Harmattan, 31–49.

Laqua, D. (2015). *The age of internationalism and Belgium, 1880–1930: Peace, progress and prestige*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Melzer, S.E & Rabin L.W. (eds) (1992). *Rebel Daughters: Women and the French Revolution*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Perceval, R. (2015). 'La Ligue de l'Enseignement et de l'Éducation permanente 1864–2014 : 150 ans de lutte pour la défense de l'enseignement officiel, *Cahiers Bruxellois/Brusselse Cahiers*, xlvii, 1, 244–261.

Van Praet, C. & Verbruggen Ch. (2015). '"Soldiers for a Joint Cause": A Relational Perspective on Local and International Educational: Leagues and Associations in the 1860s', *Low Countries Historical Review*, 130, 1, 4–24.

Rebecca Rogers & Myriam Boussahba-Bravard (eds) (2018). *Women in international and universal exhibitions, 1876–1937*, London: Routledge.

Rupp, L. J. (1997). *Worlds of Women: The Making of an International Women's Movement*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Snowden F.M. (2003). 'Mosquitoes, Quinine and the Socialism of Italian Women 1900–1914', *Past & Present*, 178, 176–209.

Spiegeleer, Ch. de (2019). *The Civilising Offensive: Social and educational reform in 19th century Belgium*, Berlin: De Gruyter.

Steele, T. (1997). 'French radical free masonry, scientific positivism and the rise of the *Universités Populaires*', Barry J. Hake & Tom Steele (eds), *Intellectuals, Activists and Reformers: Studies of cultural, social and educational reform movements in Europe, 1890–1930*, Leeds: Leeds University, 15–37.

Steele, T. (2007). *Knowledge is power! The Rise and Fall of European Popular Educational Movements, 1848–1939*, New York: Peter Lang.

Steer, M. (2015). 'Nation, Religion, Gender: The Triple Challenge of Middle-Class German-Jewish Women in World War I', *Central European History*, 48, 2, 176–198.

Stelmaszuk, Z.W. (1994). 'Helena Radlinska and the School of Adult Education and Social Work at the Free University of Poland'. In. Marriott S. & Hake B.J. (eds), *Cultural and Intercultural Experiences in European Adult Education. Essays on Popular and Higher Education since 1890*, Leeds University, 224–246.

Szapor, J. (2018). *Hungarian Women's Activism in the Wake of the First World War: From Rights to Revanche*, London: Bloomsbury, 15–34.

Tarrow, S. (1994). *Power in Movement. Social Movements, Collective Action and Politics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Tilly, Ch. (2006), *Regimes and Repertoires*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Wallace, J.M. (2006). *The Promise of Progressivism: Angelo Patri and Urban Education*, New York: Peter Lang, 67–78.

Weeks T.R. (1995). 'Polish "Progressive Anti-Semitism," 1905–1914', *East European Jewish Affairs*, 25, 2, 49–68.